

**Minutes of the Pre-Bid meeting on RFP for "Selection of Consulting firm for setting up of Project Monitoring Unit( PMU) in OSHB held on Dt. 27.06.2018 at 4.00 P.M at the 3<sup>rd</sup> conference hall of OSHB head office building.**

**MEMBERS PRESENT-**

**OSHB officers-**

1. Chief Engineer
2. Chief Accounts Officer
3. Executive Engineer( PH)
4. Executive Engineer-II
5. Executive Engineer, Cuttack
6. Nodal Officer RERA cell
7. Law Officer
8. Accounts Officer
9. T.A to Chief Engineer

**Prospective Bidders –**

1. Gourav Joshi- Grant Thornton
2. Anurag Ghosh- Price Waterhouse Coopers
3. Arjunm Varnasi- Price Waterhouse Coopers
4. Nishant - JLL
5. Bikash Mukar Panigrahi- Choice Consulting
6. V.Rajsekhar- - NAB Cons
7. Manoj Panigrahi - Ernst & Young

Chief Engineer welcomed all the members to the discussion. After going through the detailed queries put forth by different members and the queries received by e-mail, related to various points and clauses of the RFP the queries were answered point wise as detailed in the annexed sheets.



**Minutes of the Pre-Bid meeting on RFP for "Selection of Consulting firm for setting up of Project Monitoring Unit (PMU) in OSHB held on Dec. 27.06.2015 at 4.00 P.M at the 3<sup>rd</sup> conference hall of OSHB head office building.**

**Queries By M/s Ernst & Young**

Sl. No	Page No & Clause No	RFP clause	Query/Suggestions	Clarifications by OSHB
1	Page Number 8; Clause 15; - Point 5	<b>Combined and Final Evaluation</b> Proposals will finally be ranked according to their combined score (S) calculated based on technical (Ts) and financial (Fs) scores as follows: $S = Ts \times Tw + Fs \times Fw$ Where Tw and Fw are weights assigned to Technical proposal and Financial(proposal as <b>0.70 and 0.30</b> respectively)	As the support to be provided by PMU would be more technical in nature than other PMU operating in the state, the consultant selected need to have rich experience and expertise in this field. In the light of the above, request you to kindly enhance the technical weightage. We suggest the weights assigned to Technical proposal and Financial proposal be <b>0.80 and 0.20</b> respectively.	<b>Not acceptable</b>
2	Page 15; Clause Number 15; Table 1; point 2	<b>Proof of experience in the last 5 years</b> The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 1 year for a government during last 05 (five) years. For successfully managing up to 2 PMUs -10 Marks For successfully managing up to 2-5 PMUs -15 Marks For successfully managing more than 5 PMUs – 20 Marks	We request that <b>PMU experience should be in the urban sector</b> . Also additional marks should be provided if the bidder has <b>at least one PMU experience in Odisha</b>	<b>PMU experience should be in the housing sector</b>
3	Page 11; Clause Number 3; Scope of Work; Point 3	The scope of work for the Project Monitoring Unit shall include advisory support and assistance in the following major areas which shall include, but not limited to: 1. Project Management, Monitoring and Reviewing 2. Transaction Advisory services for PPP projects 3. Services for statutory clearances/Environmental/BMC/BDA/Planning Authorities/Fire/NAAI/Electricity Regulatory Authority/..Etc. 4. Procurement works 5. Capacity Building	We understand that our work would be limited to provide facilitation work for statutory clearance and we are not expected to undertake any specific studies like EIA/EMP etc.	Accepted

4	Page 12: Clause Number 3; CV Team Leader	<p>Team Leader: <b>B.E/B.Tech/B Arch</b> with MBA/PGDM/Master's Degree in Project Planning/ Construction Management from a reputed college/university</p> <p>At least <b>10 years</b> of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure/Construction Management/PPP projects out of <b>which at least 3 years of experience as a Team Leader in a reputed organization</b></p>	<p>As the team leader would primarily be responsible for project management and guiding the project team and ensuring timely submission of deliverable we feel the qualification criteria for team leader should be modified as below:</p> <p>Suggestive Change: MBA/PGDM/Master's Degree in Project Planning /Construction Management from a reputed College/University</p> <p>At least <b>8 years</b> of relevant experience in the field of Urban Infrastructure/Construction Management /PPP Projects</p>	Not acceptable
5	Page 12: Clause Number 3; CV Finance cum PPP Expert	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Masters/ Post Graduation in Finance or Chartered Accountant.</li> <li>2. At least 5 years of relevant experience in total out of which at least 2 years in working with leading consulting firm as a Transaction Advisor.</li> <li>3. S/he should have experience of consulting / implementing at least 2 PPP projects in government sector.</li> </ol>	<p>We feel the a professional with an educational background such as MBA (Finance)/CA/ICWA would be able to execute better the task assigned</p> <p>Suggestive Change <b>MBA (Finance)/CA/ICWA</b></p> <p>At least 4 years of relevant experience in total out of which at least 2 years in working with leading consulting firm as a Transaction Advisor.</p> <p>S/he should have experience of consulting/ implementing at least 2PPP projects in government sector.</p>	<p>Accepted for change of qualification to <b>MBA (Finance)/CA/ICWA.</b></p> <p>Experience clause remains unaltered.</p>
6	Page 12: Clause Number 3; CV- Procurement	<p>Masters in Commerce/ Economics/ Engineering or equivalent.</p> <p>At least 7 years of relevant experience in total of which at least 5</p>	<p><b>Suggestive change</b></p> <p>As all projects would be technical in nature we propose an infrastructure expert instead of procurement expert.</p>	<p><b>Qualification- B. Tech./ B.Arch is accepted.</b></p> <p>The Designation and experience shall remain</p>



Expert	years in government sector	All procurement related activities can be handled by Finance cum PPP expert. 1. Name of the position – Infrastructure Expert 2. Qualification- B.T.Tech./ B.Arch with at least 4 years experience in Govt./Urban Sector.	unaltered.
7 Associates ; Page 13	<p>Engineering Works Associate</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• B.E./B. Tech in Engineering.</li> </ul> <p>At least 5 years of relevant experience in total.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Finance/Procurement Associate</li> <li>• Master in Finance/Commerce</li> </ul> <p>At least 5 years of relevant experience in total.</p> <p>PPP Associate</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Masters in Finance</li> </ul> <p>At least 5 years of relevant experience in total.</p>	<p>Project associates are normally included to assist experts in report writing, making presentation, data collection etc. For the required task a relevant experience of at least 1 year should be sufficient. Request you to kindly considering amending the experience requirement from minimum 5 year to minimum 1 year</p> <p><b>We request the following educational qualification be considered for the associates:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Engineering Works Associate: B.E./B. Tech/B.Arch with minimum 1 year of relevant experience</li> <li>2. Finance/Procurement Associate: MBA (Finance) with minimum 1 year of relevant experience</li> <li>3. PPP Associate: MBA (Finance) with minimum 1 year of relevant experience</li> </ol> <p>We employ professionals from prestigious institutes like XIMB etc. and do not compromise on the quality of people we hire. For top institutes the initial compensation package would be minimum 10 lakhs or above. In light of the above we request you to kindly raise the compensation of associates</p>	<p>Accepted for qualification for point 1 &amp; 3. For procurement associates the qualification may be B.Tech/B Arch.</p> <p>Remuneration will remain unaltered.</p>

2

100

			mentioned from 50,000 to 80,000/- with an annual escalation charge of 10%.	
<b>Queries by Deloitte</b>				
8	B.2 Eligibility Criteria, Pg 3 & B.15 Bid Evaluation Methodology, Table 1, Pg 7	CI 2: The Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a Project Monitoring Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 3 years preferably in Urban Sector.  CI 15: The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 1 year for a government during last 05 (Five) years	The clauses have different requirements. Kindly confirm which one to be considered.	No change
9	C.3 Scope of work, Point 3, Pg 11	Services for statutory clearances i (Environmental/BMC/BD/Planning Authorities/Fire/NAAI/Electricity Regulatory Authority/..Etc.)  1  1	Our understanding of the "Services for statutory clearances" is support in tracking & monitoring the progress of statutory clearances & flagging criticalities. The PMU shall not be involved in getting the statutory clearances.	Acceptable
10	C.3 Associates, Pg 11	as per the requirement advised by OSHB Authority  1	Are the CVs for associates to be included in the Technical submission?	CVs may be submitted
11	General	Consortium and subcontracting of work  1	We understand from RFP that there is no constraint on Consortium and subcontracting of work	There is no scope for Consortium and subcontracting of work
12	General	Approach & Methodology  1  1	We understand that the A&M submission is not mandated as part of Technical submission. Kindly confirm.	A&M may be submitted along with Technical proposal submission.
13	General	Presentation  1  1	The presentation needs to be submitted & presented only when called for presentation post technical submission. Please confirm.	Acceptable
14	General	Travel & Lodging  1	We understand that all travel & lodging expense on account of travels required during the PMU engagement will be reimbursed at actuals. Kindly confirm.	Conveyance will be provided by OSHB. Lodging charges will be as per OSHB norms.
15	B.6 Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) pg 4	The EMD submitted by unsuccessful bidders will be discharged /returned as promptly as possible, but not later than 30 days after the expiration of the period of Proposal validity specified in this RFP	Kindly confirm when EMD will be returned for the successful bidders.	Within 30 days of closure of the contract.
16	B.17 Performance	OSHB shall issue a letter of award (LoA) along with the Draft Contract Agreement to the selected Bidder within 15 days from the	Kindly confirm when PBG will be returned for the successful bidders.	Within 30 days of closure of the contract.



	security & agreement	opening of the financial proposals. Within 15 days of such issuance, the selected firm is required to submit a Performance Security in the form of Bank Guarantee for an amount equivalent to 10% of the contract value and enter into the contract agreement with OSHB and start the work on an immediate basis.		
17	B.18 Termination of the Contract	Either party can terminate the agreement by giving 30 days prior written notice.	We request addition of the following – “In case of termination by Client, Bidder to be paid for services performed up to the effective date of termination.”	“In case of termination by Client, Bidder to be paid up to the effective date of termination.”
18	B.24 Confidentiality	The Consultant shall treat the details of the output of the Assignment and the Services as confidential and for the Consultant's own information only and shall not publish or disclose the details of the output, deliverables / milestones submitted to OSHB or the Services in any professional or technical journal or paper or elsewhere in any manner whatsoever without the previous written consent of the competent Authority.	We propose addition of the following text at the end of clause – “The confidentiality obligations shall survive the termination of this Contract / completion of services for a period of one (1) year.”	Not agreed upon
19	Form A	We agree and undertake to abide by all these terms and conditions	We would like to negotiate on certain clauses in case the project is awarded.	Not agreed upon
	<b>Queries by Price Waterhouse Coopers Pvt. Ltd</b>			
20			We request the Authority to kindly provide at least 3 weeks post the response to the pre-bid queries for submission of proposal to complete internal proposal submission checks and compliances.	May be considered by OSHB if situation arises.
	Page 2 of 20 Section 4.1	Last date for receipt of Technical and Financial proposals Dt. 13.07.2018 till 3pm	We request the Authority to kindly modify the clause as below: Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a PMU in Govt. agency in India for a period of at least 03 years preferably in <b>housing sector</b> .	Accepted.
21		Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a PMU in any Govt. agency in India for a period of at least 3 years preferably in Urban sector.	Completion on 1 PPP project may not truly represent the experience and expertise of the consulting firm. We request the authority to kindly consider the following modification in the clause.	The Applicant should have successfully completed at least 3 PPP Project( One PPP project cost of Rs. 100.00 crore or more.) for a government body/ULB in the urban sector as Transaction Advisor.
22	Page 3 of 20 Section 2.c)	The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least <b>1 PPP Project</b> for a government body/ULB in the urban sector	Application should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at	

			least 25 PPP projects for Govt. Body/ULB in the urban sector.	
23	Page 7 of 20 Section 15	Evaluation of the Technical and financial proposals will be based on <b>Quality cum Cost Based Selection</b> mode with weightage of <b>70% and 30%</b> for technical and financial proposals, respectively	We request the Authority to kindly consider providing 80:20 weightage to the Technical and Financial proposals.	<b>Clarified at Sl No. 1</b>
24	Page 9 of 20 Point no. 22	Liability- The Liability of the selected consultant under this agreement in any case shall not be beyond the amount of fees payable to the selected consultant under this agreement	We request OSHB to kindly confirm that the selected consultant will not be liable for indirect/consequential losses of any nature whatsoever.	<b>RFP Condition remains unchanged.</b>
25		Scope of Work- The scope of work for the Project Monitoring Unit shall include advisory support and assistance in the following major areas which shall include, but not limited to: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Project Management, Monitoring and Reviewing</li> <li>2. Transaction Advisory services for PPP projects</li> <li>3. Services for statutory clearances(Environmental/BMC/BDA/Planning Authorities/Fire/NAAI/Electricity Regulatory Authority/..Etc.</li> <li>4. Procurement works</li> <li>5. Capacity Building</li> </ol>	We request the authority to provide details regarding the role of the consultant and the extent in rendering each activity mentioned in the scope of work.	<b>As clarified in RFP</b>
26	Page 11 of 20 Section 3	Services for statutory clearances(Environmental/BMC/BDA/Planning Authorities/Fire/NAAI/Electricity Regulatory Authority/..Etc.	We understand that the PMU Consultant's role in statutory clearances would be to the of assisting the Authority in preparation of documents with the help of other specialised consultants appointed by OSHB. It is our understanding that the application and coordination with the Govt. Authority shall be done by OSHB. We request OSHB to kindly clarify.	<b>As clarified in Sl. No-9</b>
27	Page 11 of 20 Section 3.3	Scope of work- Capacity Building	Since the scope of work is related to housing, we request the authority to allow consultants to propose Housing Experts and Capacity Building Specialists in the proposed experts team.	<b>As per RFP condition.</b>
28	Page 11 of 20 Section 3.5	Note on Associates	We request OSHB to reconsider the per month rate for associates as the rate	<b>Already clarified at Sl. 7</b>

W

W



29			mentioned is quite low for providing 5 year experience post graduate resource for the identified position.	As clarified in Sl. No-11
30	General Query	General Query	The RFP does not mention any details on submission of bids by consortium partners. We request OSHB to confirm if the bid can be submitted two or more firms in JV or consortium.	
31	General Query	General Query	We request the Authority to provide clarity on the payment of disbursement mechanism and schedule.	As per RFP condition
32	General Query	General Query	We request the Authority to kindly confirm that the deliverables submitted by the selected consultant will only be used by OSHB and the Consultant's consent shall be obtained for use of the deliverables by the third party.	The deliverables will be sole property of OSHB.
33	General Query	General Query	We request the authority to confirm that all pre-existing IPR /working papers of the selected consultant shall be protected.	As per norm
34	Queries by CBRE South Asia Pvt. Ltd.			
35	General Query	General Query	The two statements seem contradictory as one highlights the requirement of experience in PMU projects for at least 3 years while the other highlights the requirement of experience in PMU projects for at least 1 year. We request the authority to kindly clarify this ambiguity	Already clarified at Sl. No. 08
36	General Query	General Query	The Applicant should have experience of successfully managing a Project Monitoring Unit in any government agency in India for a period of at least 3 years preferably in Urban Sector.	
37	General Query	General Query	Page 3, Clause 2, Eligibility criteria The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 1 year for a government during last 05 (Five) years	
38	General Query	General Query	PROOF OF EXPERIENCE IN THE LAST 5 YEARS	As per RFP condition
39	General Query	General Query	Typically, PMU Projects exhibit longer execution periods. Thereby we would request the authority to kindly accept the experience of the bidders in PMU projects executed in the last 10 Years.	
40	General Query	General Query	While the eligibility criteria mentions the requirement of experience of Transaction Advisory of at least 1 PPP Project for a government body/ULB in the urban sector, the same is not	Already clarified at Sl. No. 08










*W*

*10580*



		The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 1 year for a government during last 05 (Five) years	considered as a part of the marking scheme. Therefore, we would request the authority to kindly accept the experience of the bidders in Transaction Advisory of PPP Projects undertaken in the last ten years.	
36		Page 12. Minimum Qualification and Experience Finance-cum-PPP Expert - Masters/ Post Graduation in Finance or Chartered Accountant.	We request the authority to kindly accept PGDM/MBA in Finance apart from the given qualification.	As clarified in SL No-5
37		Page 12. Minimum Qualification and Experience Procurement Expert - Masters in Commerce / Economics / Engineering or equivalent.	We request the authority the kindly accept post graduation in business administration or equivalent qualification for the procurement expert apart from the given qualification.	As clarified in SL No-6
38		Page 2. Last date for receipt of Technical and financial proposals	We request the authority to kindly extend the date of submission by at least 2 weeks after the issue of the reply to the queries.	As clarified in SL No-20
	Queries by Grant Thornton			
39	Pg. No. 3. Clause No.2 (C)	The Applicant should have successfully completed Transaction Advisory of at least 1 PPP Project for a government body/ULB in the urban sector.	No amendment request .We agree to the point discussed.	As clarified in SL No-22
40	Pg. No. 7. Clause No.15. Table -1, Sl. No. 2	<b>Bid Evaluation Methodology</b> PROOF OF EXPERIENCE IN THE LAST 5 YEARS: The Bidder should have the experience of working as PMU Consultant for at least 1 year for a government during last 05 (Five) years	We request the department to keep this clause as published in the original RFP. As seeking experience in only Housing Sector would restrict the number of bidders and scope of expected work.	As per RFP condition
41	Pg. No. 12	<b>Minimum Qualification and Experience</b> Finance-cum-PPP: Masters/ Post Graduation in Finance or Chartered Accountant. Procurement Expert: Masters in Commerce/Economics/Engineering or equivalent.	We request the department to kindly include MBA with relevant experience as eligible qualification.	As clarified in SL No-5 & SL No-6
42	Pg. No. 13	<b>Associates</b> The Associates (as per the above positions list) shall be made available as and when such requirement arises and/or a separate work is being assigned to PMU which is not envisaged at this stage. The compensation for this additional requirement is capped at Rs.50,000 per month per associate with an annual escalation charge of 10%.	It is requested to the department to kindly increase the cap to at least Rs. 1,00,000.	As per RFP conditions.

## REVISED BIDDING SCHEDULE

Last date for receipt of Technical and financial proposals (Through speed / Registered post or Courier. Hand delivery is not allowed)	Dt. 20.07.2018 till 3.00 P.M
Date and Time of opening of Technical proposals	Dt . 20.07.2018 at 4.00 P.M
Date and Time for Technical presentation	Dt. 27.07.2018 at 11.00 A.M
Date and Time of opening of Financial proposals	Dt. 01.08.2018 at 04.00 P.M
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; align-items: flex-start;"> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>T.A to Chief Engineer  28/06/18</p> <p>Law Officer  28/06/18</p> <p>Accounts Officer  28/06/18</p> <p>Executive Engineer, Cuttack Nodal Officer, RERA Cell  28/06/18</p> </div> <div style="width: 45%;"> <p>Executive Engineer-II  28/06/18</p> <p>Executive Engineer(PH)  28/06/18</p> <p>Chief Accounts Officer  28/06/18</p> <p>Chief Engineer  28/06/18</p> </div> </div> <div style="text-align: center; margin-top: 20px;"> <p><b>APPROVED</b></p>  28.6  <b>Chairman</b>  <b>Odisha State Housing Board</b>  <b>Bhubaneswar</b> </div>	

 28/6